

THE QUOTATIONS IN THE KĀMASŪTRA OF VĀTSYĀYANA

According to *Kāmasūtra* I, 1¹ the author, Vātsyāyana, composed this text on the basis of older works on this subject. The tradition is given there as follows.

Prajāpati (the creator) composed a treatise on the trivarga (the three aims of life) in 100,000 *adhyāyas* (chapters). Later on the three aims of life were treated separately by different authors, i.e. *dharma* (legal and moral duty) by Manu Svāyambhuva, *artha* (political and material profit) by Brhaspati and *kāma* (love and sensual desire) by Nandin, the servant of Mahādeva (= Śiva). Only the length of Nandin's work is given: 1,000 chapters. This part was further abridged by Auddālaki Śvetaketu in 500 chapters and once more by Bābhravya Pāñcāla in 150 chapters. Bābhravya's version consisted of seven *adhikaraṇas* (main sections), the titles of which are identical with those of the seven main sections in the *Kāmasūtra* of Vātsyāyana, i.e. *sādhāraṇa-saṃprayogika-*

1 2

kanyāsaṃprayuktaka-bhāryādhikārika-pāradārika-vaiśika-aupaniṣadika).

3 4 5 6 7

The sixth part of Bābhravya's version (On courtesans) was remade by Dattaka (at the request of the courtesans of Pāṭaliputra). In this connection the other six parts were recomposed by different authors: Cārāyaṇa (1), Suvarṇanābha (2), Ghoṭakamukha (3), Gonardiya (4), Goṇikāputra (5) and Kucumāra (7).

However, as Dattaka and the others treated only parts of the subject and Bābhravya's work is difficult to study on account of its length Vātsyāyana reduced the whole to a concise manual².

We occasionally find in Sanskrit literature that a treatise claims divine origin to enhance its reputation. In *Mahābhārata* XII, 59 (Critical

1. Ed. by Madhavacharya, Kalyan-Bombay, 1935.

2. This tradition is repeated in *ārya* stanzas in the *Kandarpacūḍāmaṇi* of Vīrabhadradeva (Introduction 17-29).

Edition) another legendary tradition about the three aims of life (and *mokṣa*, redemption as the fourth) is given.

We insert here a juxtaposition of the *Kāmasūtra* and *Mahābhārata* traditions:

<i>Kāmasūtra</i> I, 1					
Prajāpati (100,000 chapters)					
(three aims)					
<i>dharma</i>	<i>artha</i>	<i>kāma</i>			
(Manu Svāyambhuva)	(Bṛhaspati)	(Nandin)			
		Auddālaki Śvetaketu (500 ch.)			
		Bābhavya (150 ch.), in seven			
		main sections, treated separately			
6	1	2	3	by	4
Dattaka	Cārāyaṇa	Suvarṇanābha	Ghoṭakamukha		Gonardīya
		5	7		
		Goṇikāputra	Kucumāra		
		the whole condensed by:			
		Vātsyāyana (36 ch. in seven main sections)			

Mahābhārata XII, 59, 28-30 and 86-91 (Critical Edition)

Svayambhū, viz. Brahman (100,000 chapters)

(three aims and redemption)

Śiva Viśālākṣa (10,000 ch., Vaiśālākṣam)

Indra (5,000 ch., Bāhudantakam)

Bṛhaspati (3,000 ch., Bārhaspatyam)

Kāvya, viz. Uśanas (1,000 ch.).

We see that a legendary original of 100,000 chapters (*adhyāyas*) is claimed by both texts, but according to the *Kāmasūtra* tradition this work of 100,000 chapters dealt with the three aims of life which were treated separately afterwards, whereas in the *Mahābhārata* tradition (XII, 59, 30 and 85) redemption (*mokṣa*) too belonged to the contents of this legendary work. However, this work is there called *daṇḍanīti* (*Mahābhārata* XII, 59, 78 f.), and the enumerated topics refer in most cases to political problems, so that Kane³ and others interpret this report as the tradition of political science. Actually Bṛhaspati is elsewhere known as political teacher (e.g. in the *Kāmasūtra*) and in the list of experts on *rājādharma* (king's duty) in *Mahābhārata* XI, 58, 1 f. we find the following names: Bṛhaspati, Viśālākṣa, Kāvya, Indra, Prācetasā Manu, Bharadvāja and Gaurasīras.

If we compare the tradition in *Kāmasūtra* I, 1 with that in *Mahābhārata* XII, 59 we find that both presuppose an opus magnum composed by the Creator (Prajāpati or Svayambhū). Other Sanskrit treatises

3. *History of Dharmaśāstra*, Vol. III, Poona, 1946, p. 4.

too claim divine origin, e.g. the god Brahman is regarded as the founder of the drama (*nāṭya*); a *dharmaśūtra* is attributed to Viṣṇu, etc.

We might argue that these texts really existed but were attributed to gods. However, the length of 100,000 chapters is incredible, and even a length of 1,000 chapters is questionable. Vātsyāyana, the author of the *Kāmasūtra*, is not quoting Prajāpati or the servant of Śiva (Nandin) but only Auddālaki and the later authorities. None of these texts is extant any more and that's why we are not able to verify the authenticity of the quotations⁴. Bābhravya Pāñcāla was the founder of a *kāma* school (Bābhraviyāḥ) which Vātsyāyana quotes several times.

According to *Kāmasūtra* I, 3 Pāñcāla (viz. Bābhravya) established the 64 (i.e. 8 times 8) ways of love (Pāñcālī catuḥṣaṣṭih) which are distinguished from the 64 arts (*kalāḥ*). Vātsyāyana accepts the term « Sixty-four » only as a figurative term because the number of the ways of love varies. For Vātsyāyana it is a technical term like the « seven-leaved » tree (*saptaparṇa*) which has more than seven leaves (II, 8).

The individual authors are quoted in those main sections for which they are said to be specialists. Dattaka plays a special role because he is mentioned first in Vātsyāyana's enumeration but is quoted as expert on courtesans (the sixth main section), whereas the other individual authors are enumerated in the order of the main sections. Only in a few cases are they mentioned in an other context, and one of them, the specialist of the seventh main section, is not quoted (Kucumāra)⁵. In most cases the opinions of the individual teachers are quoted without the refutation of Vātsyāyana, e.g. Ghoṣakamukha in the 3rd, Gonardīya in the 4th main section. Such quotations are interpreted by the commentary Jayamaṅgalā: *gonardīya iti pūjārtham adhikaraṇe 'dhikṛtatvāt* (Gonardīya honourably because he is the authority for this *adhikaraṇa*) IV, 32. This is different from the *Arthaśāstra* of Kauṭilya, where in most cases the views of the individual authors are contradicted by another individual author and/or by Kauṭilya.

In the *Arthaśāstra* the individual authors discuss with each other in a stereotyped order. Such debates are no verbatim quotations from extant works. However, they may represent authentic views though their style must be fictitious. In the *Kāmasūtra* stylistic adaptations are less evident⁶. Here the individual authors occur in a stereotyped form only once without refuting each other, viz. *Kāmasūtra* I, 5 treats three types of women (*nāyikās*) to be resorted to; then Goṇikāputra mentions

4. There are only few data on Vātsyāyana's predecessors in Sanskrit literature. These references were compiled by Richard Schmidt, *Beiträge zur indischen Erotik*, Berlin, 1922, § 1 sub voce and by S. C. Upadhyaya, *Kama Sutra of Vatsyayana* (Complete Translation), Bombay, 1961, pp. 47 ff.

5. His name occurs only in I, 3 in the 21st of the 64 arts (*kalāḥ*): *kaucumārāṣca yogāḥ*, the tricks of Kucumāra.

6. Though they exist, e.g. in V, 6 Goṇikāputra refers directly to the quotation of the teachers: « *te hi...* ».

a fourth type, and ultimately Cārāyaṇa a fifth, Suvarṇanābha a sixth, Ghoṭakamukha a seventh and Gonardīya an eighth type.

The quotations of the teachers (*ity ācāryāḥ*) have a purport similar to that in the *Arthaśāstra*. These quotations render the views of a varying number of specialists, as do the opinions cited as *ity eke* (some say). Here it goes without saying that the stylistic form must be by the author Vātsyāyana, but there is no clue that their contents are fictitious too. Vātsyāyana refers to opinions which were really represented or to possible objections (to the latter clearly in the form *tatra etaḥ syāt* / it may be objected here [II, 6]). Vātsyāyana expresses in his own words also the views of special groups (materialists, fatalists, and political thinkers [I, 2]), a local custom (*deśasātmyam*, II, 16) or a general opinion (*prāyo- vadaḥ*, III, 28; V, 40, 43). Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana (i.e. isolated statements without a debate) emphasize Vātsyāyana's standpoint.

The *Kāmasūtra* is far less polemical than the *Arthaśāstra*, where most views are refuted⁷. In the *Kāmasūtra* a greater number of quotations remain undisputed or are only slightly modified. A by-effect of quoting in both texts is to variegate the *bhāṣya* style. The debates in the *Kāmasūtra* are less elaborate, as the *Kāmasūtra* is more concise and closer to the *sūtra* than to the *śāstra* style.

7. See Appendix II. The relations between Kauṭilya and Vātsyāyana were discussed by FRIEDRICH WILHELM, *Die Beziehungen zwischen Kāmasūtra and Arthaśāstra*, in: « Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft », Band 116, 2 (1966), pp. 291-310. On the roll of the quotations in the *Arthaśāstra* see FRIEDRICH WILHELM, *Politische Polemiken im Staatslehrbuch des Kauṭilya*, Wiesbaden, 1960 (further references in both publications).

THE QUOTATIONS IN THE KĀMASŪTRA OF VĀTSYĀYANA

Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>)	Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>)	Chapters (<i>adhyāya</i>)	The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>)	Schools	Individual authors	Other references	Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana without debate
I		1	(1)			to V.'s predecessors laukayatīkāḥ + V. (materialists) Kālakāranīkāḥ + V. (fatalists) and arthacintakāḥ + V. (political thinkers)	
sādhāranākhyam (General)	2	(2)	once + V.				
	3	(3)	once + V.		(Kucumāra) // (Pāñcāla) Cārāyaṇa		
	4	(4)		Bābhraṇīyāḥ	Goṇikāputra //		once
	5	(5)		+ Goṇikāputra	Cārāyaṇa + Suvarṇanābha + Ghoṭakamukha + Gonardīya + V. + eke (some)		
II		6	(1)	Bābhraṇīyāḥ	Auddālaki (twice) Bābhraṇya (Śloka according to Commentary)	three times: tatra etat syāt (it may be objected here) + tacca na (this is not the case) prāyovādāḥ (general opinion)	once
sāmprayogikam (on sexual union)							

Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>)	Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>)	The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>)	Schools	Individual authors	Other references	Self-quotations of <i>Vātsyāyana</i> without debate
	7	(1)			tantrajñāḥ (experts of kāmāntara) twice in stanzas ity ācaṣṭe (they call) + ācāryavādāḥ (the opinion of the teachers) + eke (some) + Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + V. // eke (some) + V.	
	8	(2)	Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + Suvarṇanābha	(Pāṇcāla)		
	9	(3)		Suvarṇanābha		twice
	10	(4)				
	11	(5)				
	12	(5)		Suvarṇanābha		
	13	(6)	Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + Suvarṇanābhaḥ (the different positions called...)	Suvarṇanābha + V.		
	14	(6)				
	15	(7)				
	16	(7)				
	17	(8)			deśasātmīyam etad (this is a local custom) + V.	
	18	(8)				

Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>)	Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>)	The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>)	Schools	Individual authors	Other references	Self-quotations of Vāisyaṇa without debate
		once + V.			evam hy āhuḥ (thus they say) + V.	
		(9)				
		(10)				
		(10)				
		(1)		Dattaka // (Bābhravya) Ghoṭakamukha (twice)		
III	kanyāsaṃ- prayuktakam (acquisition of a wife)	(1)		Ghoṭakamukha (twice)		
		(2)	Bābhraviyāḥ + V.	Ghoṭakamukha		
		(3)		Ghoṭakamukha		
		(3)				
		(4)		Ghoṭakamukha	prāyovādaḥ (general opinion)	once
		(4)	once			
		(4)				
		(5)	once			
		(1)		Gonardiya (twice)		
IV	bhāryādihikārikam (on married women)	(1)		Gonardiya		
		(2)	Bābhraviyāḥ + Gonardiya + V.			
		(2)				
		(2)				
		(2)				

Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>)	Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>)	Chapters (<i>adhyāya</i>)	The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>)	Schools	Individual authors	Other references	Self-quotations of <i>Vātsyāyana</i> without debate
V pāradārikam (on other men's wives)	40	(1)	once + V.		Gonikāputra	prāyovādah (general opinion)	
	41	(1)					
	42	(1)					
	43	(2)	once + V.			prāyovādah (general opinion)	
	44	(2)					
	45	(3)		Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + V. //	Auddālaki + Bābhraṇvīyāḥ +		
VI vaiśikam (on courtesans)	46	(4)		Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + Gonikāputra + V.	Gonikāputra + V. //		
	47	(5)			Gonikāputra		
	48	(6)					
	49	(6)	once + Gonikāputra + V.	Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + V.			once
	50	(1)	once + V.				
	51	(1)					
	52	(2)					
	53	(3)	once + V.		Dattaka (Dattaka implicite)		
	54	(3)					
	55	(3)			Dattaka		
	56	(4)	once + V.				
	57	(5)	seven times + V.				
	58	(6)	after each		Auddālaki + Bābhraṇvīyāḥ		

Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>)	Topics (<i>prakarana</i>)	Chapters (<i>adhyāya</i>)	The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>)	Schools	Individual authors	Other references	Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana without debate
VII	59	(1)					
aupaṇiṣadikam (secret means)	60	(1)					
	61	(1)					
	62	(2)			(Bābhravya + V.)		
	63	(2)			Bābhravya, V.		
	64	(4)			(in stanza)		

THE QUOTATIONS IN THE ARTHASĀSTRA OF KAUTILYA (OR KAUTILYA)

		<i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i>	<i>Schools</i>	<i>Individual authors</i>
<i>adhyakaraṇas</i>	<i>prakaraṇas</i>			
I	1	once + K.	Mānavāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + Auśanasah + K.	
	4			Bhāradvāja + Visālākṣa + Parāśara + Piśuna + Kauṇapadanta + Vātavyādhi + Bāhudanīputra + K.
	6	once + K. (in stanza)		
	11		Mānavāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + Auśanasah + K.	Bhāradvāja + Visālākṣa + Parāśara + Piśuna + K.
	13		Āmbhīyāḥ + K.	Bhāradvāja + Visālākṣa + Parāśara + Piśuna + Kauṇapadanta + Vātavyādhi + K.
II	25		Mānavāḥ + Parāśarāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + Auśanasah + K.	
III	27	once + K.		
	59	once + K.		
	60	once + apare (others) + K.	Auśanasah	
	63		Auśanasah + Mānavāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + K.	
	66	once + K.		
	71	once + K.	Mānavāḥ + Auśanasah + Bārhaspatyāḥ + K.	

<i>adhikarāṇas</i>	<i>prakarāṇas</i>	<i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i>	<i>Schools</i>	<i>Individual authors</i>
	73	twice + K. after each		
	74	once + K.		
IV	93			Kātyāyana + Kanika Bhāradvāja + Dirgha Cārāyana + Ghotamukha + Kujjaka + Pīṣuna + Pīṣunaputra
V				
VI	98	once + Vātavyādhi + K.		
VII	99	once + K.		
	103	once + K.		
	108	twice + K. after each		
	112	once + K.		
	116	fourteen times. + K. after each		
	117	once + K.		
	119	once + K.		
	122	once + K.		
VIII	127	once + K.		Bhāradvāja + K. + Viśālākṣa + K. + Parāśara + K. + Pīṣuna + K. + Kaṇvapadanta + K. + Vātavyādhi + K.
	128	four times + K. after each		
	129			
	130	twelve times + K. after each		Same form of debate as in VIII, 127

<i>adhikāraṇas</i>	<i>prakāraṇas</i>	<i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i>	<i>Schools</i>	<i>Individual authors</i>
IX	135	four times + K. after each eke (some) + eke + K. once + K.		
X	138		Aśanasaḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ	
XI	158			Bhāradvāja + Viśalakṣa + K.
XII	162			
XIII				
XIV			refers to schools in I, 11 and X, 158	
XV				

Self-quotations of K. (= Kauṭilya or Kauṭilya) in I, 3; III, 4; VII, 119 and XIII, 174.